

Defining moments

from the past with lessons for a post-9/11 world...

Lesson Three Making a Decision

Overview/Objectives

Students will:

- Use the spreadsheet below (spreadsheet is embedded as a Microsoft Excel object) to determine policy options, establish criteria for the solution, weight the criteria in terms of importance and rate the options relative to each criterion to determine a solution to the problem.

DECISION MAKING SPREADSHEET									
<i>Problem:</i>									
<i>Main goal:</i>									
Options									
Criteria	Weighting	Rating	R x W	Rating	R x W	Rating	R x W	Rating	R x W
			0		0		0		0
			0		0		0		0
			0		0		0		0
			0		0		0		0
			0		0		0		0
Totals			0		0		0		0

- Determine the options available to the United States government in its effort to protect the west coast and respond to the public outcry after the attack on Pearl Harbor.

Benchmarks Targeted

SOC.I.4.HS.1
 SOC.I.4.HS.2
 SOC.I.4.HS.4
 SOC.VI.1.HS.1

Procedure

After students have completed the Problem Framing lesson (Lesson 1), explain that they are defining the problem as the United States government defined it – that action had to be taken to protect the Western Coast of the United States.

An effective way to complete this lesson is to first have the students work as a class to make decisions together, and then work individually (or in small groups) to make a decision on a different problem relating to the video content.

Have students generate a list of possible policy options. Enter them in the worksheet in the spaces available under “Options.” (Possible options include *Post Armed Guards In Japanese American Communities, Remove Japanese American Citizens To Internment Camps, Increase Patrol Boats Along the Pacific Coast, Leave The Japanese Americans Alone* etc.

Next, have students create the criteria that would determine if the option were acceptable. For example criteria might include *Preserve Human Rights, Guarantee Security Of The United States, Gain Approval Of U.S. Citizens, Save Costs*, etc. Enter the criteria in the column labeled “Criteria.”

Now students need to weight the criteria in terms of importance by assigning a number from 1-4, with 4 being most important and 1 being the least. Some criteria may have the same number. If the class believes that *Guarantee Security For The United States* is the most important, then enter a number 4 in

the column to the right of that criterion. Next, the students need to examine each option in light of the criteria. For example, if option # 1 is *Leave The Japanese Americans Alone*, in the columns below assigning scores from 1-4 to designate how well it meets the established criteria, with 4 being the most effective. *Leaving The Japanese Americans Alone* might get a “4” for the criteria of *Preserving Human Rights* but would get a lower number for *Gaining Approval of the majority of the West Coast’s population*. As the numbers are entered, the program automatically computes the totals. The option with the highest point value wins and represents the action to be taken.

Allow time for students to examine the decision that was reached. They can examine how changes in weighting of criteria and rating of options would have changed the decision. They can also examine it in terms of how the criteria and options would have been different for different interest groups and in different historic periods. They can discuss how a decision that wins might not be acceptable to implement.

Finally, either individually or in small groups, have the students complete a decision-making model for another problem suggested by the video. Students can brainstorm topics such as Japanese American responses to internment, or Frank Murphy’s opinions as a Supreme Court Justice.

Rubrics

- 4- Options selected are appropriate, considering the way the problem is framed, and represent a varied, creative and thoughtful range of solutions; criteria chosen allows options to be considered in a complete, thoughtful and effective way, demonstrating complete understanding of the options and problem; weighting and ratings are selected thoughtfully, representing a thorough understanding of the relationship between the criteria and options in light of the way the problem is framed.
- 3- Options selected are appropriate, considering the way the problem is framed, and represent a range of solutions; criteria chosen allows options to be considered thoughtfully and effectively; weighting and ratings are selected, representing an understanding of the relationship between the criteria and options in light of the way the problem is framed.
- 2- Options selected are appropriate, considering the way the problem is framed; criteria chosen allows options to be considered effectively; weightings and ratings are selected, sometimes representing an understanding of the relationship between the criteria and options in light of the way the problem is framed.
- 1- Options selected are not appropriate considering the way the problem is framed; criteria does not allow options to be considered effectively; Numbers are selected, sometimes representing an understanding of the relationship between the criteria and options in light of the way the problem is framed; weightings and ratings are selected, rarely representing an understanding of the relationship between the criteria and options in light of the way the problem is framed.

Resources

Here are some Web sites to start with:

<http://www.sfmuseum.org/war/evactxt.html>

<http://cstl.semo.edu/us107/Mainst/Homefront/roberts/>

<http://www.history.navy.mil/photos/events/wwii-pac/pearlhbr/pearlhbr.htm>

<http://www.lib.washington.edu/exhibits/harmony/Documents/wrapam.html>

[http://www2.law.cornell.edu/cgi-](http://www2.law.cornell.edu/cgi-bin/foliocgi.exe/historic/query=%5BGroup+323+U.S.+214:%5D(%5BLevel+Case+Citation:%5D%7C%5BGroup+citemenu:%5D)/doc/%7B@1%7D/hit_headings/words=4/hits_only)

[bin/foliocgi.exe/historic/query=%5BGroup+323+U.S.+214:%5D\(%5BLevel+Case+Citation:%5D%7C%5BGroup+citemenu:%5D\)/doc/%7B@1%7D/hit_headings/words=4/hits_only](http://www2.law.cornell.edu/cgi-bin/foliocgi.exe/historic/query=%5BGroup+323+U.S.+214:%5D(%5BLevel+Case+Citation:%5D%7C%5BGroup+citemenu:%5D)/doc/%7B@1%7D/hit_headings/words=4/hits_only)